



CONSORTIO

Journal of Economics, Social Sciences, Law and Education



Magazine Publisher

ISSN 2956-820X

PUBLISHER

Zofia Zamenhof foundation

Head of the Scientific Council:

Dr. Wojciech Duranowski, Prof. dr Tina Gelashvili

Head of the Editorial Team Zbigniew Dąbrowski

Publication in English

2nd edition of the magazine

CONTACT

Address: 11/49 Mazowiecka Street, 00-052 Warsaw

Foundation's website: www.zofiazamenhof.pl

Phone: + 48 604 997 656 + 48 516 398 860

E-mail address: biuro@zofiazamenhof.pl

Publisher's website: www.fzzpublishing.eu

Sustainable Development Goals

Copyright © 2023 by Zofia Zamenhof foundation

Journal of Economics, Social Sciences, Law and Education, Editor-in-Chief
Zbigniew Dąbrowski, Zofia Zamenhof Foundation, 2023

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any means without the written permission of the publisher.

Table of Contents

	PAGE
1 Zbigniew Dąbrowski From the Chief Editor	4
2 Simone Zorzi Navigating the Transition: Advancing from Institutional to Community-Based Care for Individuals with Intellectual Disabilities	7
3 Teona Diasamidze Ensuring Education for All: Legal Framework and the Monitoring of Out-of- School Children in Georgia	21
4 Vasyl Buzhak Book Review “Overcoming the Past: A Global History of Ukraine”	32
5 Dodo Nadiradze For the Comparative Analysis of the Historical Materials of the European Catholic Missionaries and the Georgian Historian of the 18th Century	36
6 Liudmyla Huliaieva In Memory of Yaroslav Holovko (1962–2023)	51
7 Simone Zorzi In memory of Gilberto Marzano	55
8 From the Editorial Team	57
	3



From the Chief Editor



Author Note

Zbigniew Dąbrowski

Head of the Editorial Team

Dear Readers,

We present to you the second issue of the scientific journal "Consortio - Journal of Economics, Social Sciences, Law and Education". I would like to remind you that the idea for our journal was born from the cooperation of members of the Zofia Zamenhof Foundation with other countries within the framework of various European projects. Members of the Foundation's Board, who are close to the educational mission, invited representatives of scientific institutions and universities from different countries to cooperate. This is how the Scientific Council of the Publishing House was established. We are united by the desire to cultivate scientific discussion in the fields of economics, social sciences, law, education, pedagogy and teaching methodology, as well as new technologies in social communication, science and education.

Articles published in the journal constitute a platform for the exchange of views and research between specialists representing various scientific disciplines and various institutions. Our goal is to enable them to share their observations with the readers of the publication. Science and education have always fought against prejudices, stereotypes and animosities between communities and nations, which is why our mission is also to overcome contemporary problems and find a way to understanding. We believe that education can positively change people and social processes. This is especially important in the current geopolitical and social situation.

An important element of our mission is still work within the Eastern Partnership, the aim of which is to strengthen the political association and economic integration of six partner countries with the European Union. Poland and Sweden initiated the creation of this EU program and belong to the group of countries that strongly support the association of the group members with the European Union. Unfortunately, the situation in Europe has deteriorated. Russia is constantly attacking Ukraine, which is defending its freedom. The situation in Georgia has also changed drastically and deteriorated. Belarus is still under the rule of a dictator. Due to historical and social conditions, the Zofia Zamenhof Foundation wants to support the integration of these countries with the values and activities of the European Union. The processes and changes taking place in science are of significant importance for our work and for the entire education system.

Establishing scientific cooperation allows for strengthening ties between research centers and developing international educational achievements. Universities, educators and scientific and educational institutions are facing new difficult challenges due to the situation in Europe and the world.

We are not limited to Europe. We are pleased to welcome scientists from Israel, Turkey and other non-European countries. We count on further new contacts and interesting publications. The journal is the 2024 edition. We are already starting to collect materials for the third edition of the journal. We invite to publish, especially young scientists, people writing doctoral dissertations and everyone who likes the idea of our journal.

We hope that the articles published in the second issue of the journal "Consortio" will help readers deepen their knowledge in the fields they deal with, and will also initiate further discussion and international cooperation between educational centers and scientists. At the same time, as the Zofia Zamenhof Foundation Publishing House, we encourage authors and researchers to co-create subsequent editions of the journal.

Information on the rules for submitting articles can be found on our website www.fzzpublishing.eu under the "Publication Rules" tab. On behalf of the Editorial Office of the journal and the entire Zofia Zamenhof Foundation Publishing House, I would like to thank the authors of the submitted articles and their reviewers.

Zbigniew Dabrowski

Editor-in-Chief



2

Navigating the Transition: Advancing from Institutional to Community-Based Care for Individuals with Intellectual Disabilities

Author Note

Simone Zorzi

**Director of disability services - Health authority
University of Udine (Italy)**

**Vice president of Ecoististuo Friuli Venezia Giulia
(Italy)**

**Visitor researcher at Rezekne Academy of
Technologies (Latvia)**

Abstract

This paper examines the evolution of care and support for individuals with neurodevelopmental disorders, including intellectual disabilities, transitioning from institutionalized models to community-based approaches that emphasize independence, self-determination, and quality of life. It highlights the progress driven by international frameworks such as the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and regional policies like the European Disability Strategy, while addressing the persistent disparities in service delivery, societal stigma, and resource allocation. The paper integrates quality-of-life constructs and ecological models of social inclusion to propose strategies that foster autonomy, dignity, and meaningful participation in society. Through an exploration of the challenges and strengths in current systems, the study underscores the critical need for holistic, person-centered approaches that align with international standards and address barriers at systemic and individual levels.

Introduction

In recent decades, there has been a significant shift in how programs and services for individuals with neurodevelopmental disorders (NDS), including intellectual disabilities, are conceptualized and implemented. Historically, these services were dominated by institutional approaches that marginalized individuals, limiting their opportunities for autonomy and active participation in society (Mansell et al., 2007). The focus has gradually transitioned to promoting social inclusion and enhancing quality of life through community-based initiatives that emphasize independence and self-determination (Buntinx and Schalock, 2010; Ouellette-Kuntz et al., 2015; Giangreco, 2017).

These approaches seek to empower individuals to live as fully participating members of their communities, shifting away from outdated practices that often perpetuated isolation. Emerging frameworks, such as neurodiversity and global disability studies, have further redefined traditional perceptions of normalcy and ability. These paradigms advocate for the recognition of diverse abilities as strengths, fostering environments where individuals with disabilities are valued for their unique contributions to society (Farooqi & Ali, 2023).

This reorientation aligns closely with the principles outlined in the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) (United Nations, 2006), which asserts the right of individuals to live independently and make autonomous choices about their living arrangements.

This reorientation aligns closely with the principles outlined in the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) (United Nations, 2006), which asserts the right of individuals to live independently and make autonomous choices about their living arrangements. The CRPD emphasizes that meaningful inclusion requires more than policy declarations; it necessitates actionable measures that protect individual rights while fostering environments conducive to inclusion and dignity. At the European level, the importance of transitioning from institutional to community-based care has been increasingly recognized. During the 2007–2013 programming period, the European Structural and Investment Funds (ESI Funds) identified this transition as a strategic priority, encouraging member states to redirect resources toward community-centered initiatives. Similarly, the European Disability Strategy 2010–2020 underscored the importance of facilitating independent living by restricting ESI funds to initiatives that promoted deinstitutionalization. These efforts have contributed to the gradual decline of institutional care in favor of person-centered approaches designed to enhance autonomy, dignity, and social participation. However, the implementation of these policies has progressed unevenly across Europe, with significant disparities in service accessibility and quality persisting between regions and countries (Mittler, 2015). The challenges faced by individuals with disabilities, particularly intellectual disabilities, remain a pressing issue across Europe and globally. While the shift toward inclusion and community-based care has brought about many positive changes, substantial barriers remain. Disparities in the availability and quality of support services, persistent societal stigma, and structural limitations in service delivery highlight the need for continued reform. Addressing these challenges requires a comprehensive understanding of how constructs like quality of life and social inclusion can inform service design and implementation, ensuring that the rights of individuals with disabilities are upheld in practice. This paper aims to provide an overview of the current state of services for individuals with intellectual disabilities in Europe, identifying both strengths and persistent gaps. By examining existing models of care and their alignment with international standards, the paper seeks to highlight key challenges and propose strategies for future improvements.

The ultimate goal is to advocate for systems that prioritize quality of life and social inclusion, fostering an environment where individuals with intellectual disabilities can achieve their full potential and actively contribute to society.

Disability and intellectual disability: a growing phenomenon in society

In the EU, people with disabilities face significant barriers to accessing healthcare, education, and employment, limiting their participation in social and political life. Despite efforts toward inclusivity, nearly half of the EU population perceives discrimination based on disability as widespread. In 2023, 27% of EU residents over the age of 16 reported having a disability, equating to approximately 101 million individuals. These figures reveal an urgent need for policies ensuring equal rights and participation (European Council, 2023). Disability prevalence varies significantly across the EU. In 2023, Latvia reported the highest rate at 40.7%, followed by Denmark (36.7%) and Finland (34.8%). This variation underscores the need for tailored interventions addressing unique national challenges. Disability rates also differ by demographic factors, with older individuals and women more frequently affected. Women in the EU reported a disability rate of 29.2% in 2023 compared to 24.3% for men, revealing gender-specific disparities that must be addressed in policy initiatives. People with disabilities face systemic challenges beyond discrimination, including poverty and unemployment. In 2020, unemployment among disabled individuals aged 20–26 was 17.7%, nearly double that of their non-disabled counterparts. Poverty further compounds these barriers, with 28.8% of people with disabilities at risk of poverty or social exclusion in 2023, compared to 18% of the non-disabled population. These issues highlight the interconnection between limited educational opportunities, inaccessible healthcare, and economic vulnerability. Intellectual disability affects 1–3% of the global population, characterized by significant limitations in intellectual functioning and adaptive skills, including communication, self-care, and social abilities (WHO, 2019). Typically diagnosed before age 18, its causes are multifaceted, encompassing genetic, biological, and environmental factors. Prevalence and management vary widely, influenced by socio-economic conditions, resource availability, and health policies (AAIDD, 2020). In high-income countries, better access to healthcare and diagnostic services enables early detection and structured support systems, including educational and employment integration.

Conversely, limited services in low- and middle-income countries often lead to inadequate management, perpetuating social isolation and stigma (WHO, 2019). These disparities emphasize the need for coordinated efforts to improve quality of life and uphold fundamental rights.

European support services for persons with intellectual disability

Across Europe, the prevalence of intellectual disabilities underscores disparities in healthcare systems, welfare infrastructure, and support services. Nordic and Western European countries, characterized by more advanced social welfare systems, report higher diagnosis rates due to well-developed healthcare and diagnostic infrastructure (EU-SILC, Eurostat, 2020). These regions benefit from greater resource allocation for early detection and tailored intervention programs. Conversely, socio-economic disparities in less affluent countries lead to delayed diagnoses and insufficient support systems, leaving many individuals underserved (Inclusion Europe, 2019). Individuals with intellectual disabilities in Europe primarily depend on three categories of support services: residential care, day centers, and supported employment programs. These services are instrumental in fostering social inclusion and improving quality of life, yet their accessibility and effectiveness vary significantly across regions. Residential facilities, including group homes and larger institutions, serve as the primary living arrangements for approximately 50% of individuals with intellectual disabilities in Europe. These facilities aim to provide continuous support for daily activities, healthcare needs, and personal safety. Best practices advocate for a person-centered approach that prioritizes autonomy, active participation in decision-making, and respect for individual preferences (EASPD, 2020). This model promotes dignity and well-being, encouraging residents to engage in meaningful activities and maintain connections with the broader community. Day care centers offer critical support by providing safe spaces for social interaction, skill development, and recreational activities. These centers are designed to enhance autonomy and improve quality of life through programs such as self-sufficiency training, creative arts, and communication skill development (EASPD, 2020). They also provide much-needed respite for caregivers, allowing them temporary relief from the responsibilities of continuous care. Despite their potential, the quality and availability of day care centers vary widely across Europe.

Some centers excel in promoting community integration and personal growth, while others struggle due to limited resources, inadequate staffing, or inconsistent service quality. These disparities create uneven experiences for individuals with intellectual disabilities, limiting the impact of such programs on their long-term development and inclusion (European Commission, 2021). Employment remains a significant challenge for individuals with intellectual disabilities, with only 25–30% participating in supported or sheltered employment programs (EASPD, 2020). These programs are designed to provide tailored work opportunities that enhance economic independence, self-esteem, and social inclusion. By accommodating individual abilities, such programs create pathways for skill development and meaningful engagement in the workforce. However, numerous barriers hinder broader participation. Employer biases, insufficient state incentives, and a lack of inclusive workplace environments discourage companies from hiring individuals with intellectual disabilities. Additionally, limited access to targeted employment support programs and inclusive technologies further restrict opportunities for economic self-sufficiency. As a result, many individuals face heightened social and economic vulnerabilities, emphasizing the urgent need for expanded and well-funded employment initiatives (Eurostat, 2021). The disparities in support services for individuals with intellectual disabilities across Europe highlight systemic inequalities in resource allocation and service delivery. To ensure meaningful inclusion and improved quality of life, reforms must prioritize person-centered approaches, expand access to community-based programs, and address employment challenges through targeted interventions. By fostering autonomy and community engagement, Europe can better align its services with international standards, such as those outlined in the CRPD, and advance the rights and well-being of individuals with intellectual disabilities.

Risk of institutionalization

Institutionalization poses a significant risk for individuals with intellectual disabilities, profoundly impacting their quality of life and overall well-being. In many European countries, these individuals live in highly structured institutions that aim to provide essential support for daily needs, safety, and healthcare. However, many facilities remain highly institutionalized, with rigid schedules and limited opportunities for personal choice or social interaction.

These environments often foster dependency, restricting residents' abilities to develop essential life skills or participate actively in the community. Isolation and reduced quality of life are common outcomes in such settings, emphasizing the need for systemic reform to prioritize inclusion and self-determination (European Disability Forum, 2020). This issue can also extend to residential services and day care centers, which, if not professionally structured with a strong focus on rights, social inclusion, and quality of life, can unintentionally mirror conditions of institutionalization. Even facilities designed to support individuals with intellectual disabilities can become overly restrictive when they lack inclusive principles, thereby limiting autonomy and reducing opportunities for personal choice and meaningful community involvement (European Disability Forum, 2020). In such conditions, individuals may experience a diminished sense of agency and control, which are crucial for personal development and mental well-being. This restricted autonomy often fosters dependency, as individuals are deprived of opportunities to practice decision-making skills or engage in activities that nurture self-reliance. Additionally, highly structured environments can restrict social interactions, both within and outside of the institution, leading to long-term social isolation and stunted development of essential social skills (European Disability Forum, 2020).

The scarcity of alternative care models further compounds the risk of institutionalization. Alternatives such as family-based residences or independent living support services provide less restrictive environments where individuals can experience greater autonomy and social inclusion. Family-based care offers a supportive setting with a familial structure that enhances opportunities for personal choice and individualized care (Inclusion Europe, 2019). Similarly, independent living services empower individuals by offering tailored support that allows them to live in their own homes or in small, community-integrated residences. Unfortunately, the limited availability of these options in many regions often results in continued reliance on traditional institutional models as the primary means of care.

The European Strategy for the Rights of Persons with Disabilities 2021-2030 addresses these challenges by advocating for deinstitutionalization and promoting the expansion of community-based support services. This strategy encourages a shift from institutional settings to more inclusive, community-integrated care, enabling people with intellectual disabilities to live in environments that respect their rights to dignity, autonomy, and social participation (European Commission, 2021).

By expanding community services, the initiative seeks to ensure that individuals with intellectual disabilities have access to settings that foster self-determination, support the building of meaningful relationships, and encourage active involvement in society. Research underscores the benefits of community-based living over institutionalization. Studies reveal that individuals with intellectual disabilities in community settings report higher levels of satisfaction, dignity, and social engagement compared to those in institutional care. Community living fosters social relationships and allows individuals to engage in daily activities that support personal growth and meaningful interactions (European Association of Service Providers for Persons with Disabilities [EASPD], 2020). These settings encourage independence, social integration, and self-fulfillment —qualities often restricted in institutionalized environments. Since the majority of individuals with intellectual disabilities currently reside in residential or day care services, this study aims to examine living conditions within these environments. The objective is to develop monitoring systems that evaluate quality of life and safeguard the rights of individuals with intellectual disabilities. Through systematic analysis, the study seeks to establish benchmarks and propose recommendations for improved care models that foster autonomy, inclusion, and overall well-being in residential and day care settings.

Overcoming barriers through a quality of life-oriented approach

Lifelong care for individuals with intellectual disabilities requires a holistic and multidisciplinary approach that extends beyond basic healthcare. This type of care demands consistent support and tailored planning to meet the evolving needs of individuals throughout their lives. Unlike other populations, individuals with intellectual disabilities benefit from continuous care aimed at ensuring optimal quality of life while promoting self-determination, social inclusion, and physical and mental well-being. Lifelong care is not merely a health intervention but an enduring commitment that integrates healthcare, education, employment, and social inclusion into a cohesive framework of support. A cornerstone of this approach is the early and thorough assessment of needs, leading to the development of an Individual Plan (IP). These personalized plans enable timely and flexible interventions with long-lasting positive effects, supporting autonomy, social engagement, and active participation.

IPs are participatory in nature, incorporating input from family members and caregivers and adapting to the individual's developmental progress and situational changes. Personalized planning helps individuals navigate significant life transitions while fostering their independence and enhancing their quality of life. Adult services play a pivotal role in providing living conditions that respect the dignity and aspirations of individuals with intellectual disabilities. These services should actively promote participation, independence, and emotional well-being, as the environment and resources available within residential or support settings significantly influence outcomes. The professionalism of staff delivering these services is a critical factor, directly correlating with physical health improvements, social inclusion, and overall quality of life.

Effective service provision extends beyond physical assistance, empowering individuals to make choices, develop skills, and engage meaningfully in their communities. Transition planning, especially during the shift from child to adult services, is essential for ensuring continuity in care and enabling integration into living and working environments that prioritize autonomy and active participation. Social inclusion is a key element of lifelong care, as it enables individuals with intellectual disabilities to live fully within their communities. Inclusive experiences in daily life, work, and social interactions contribute not only to psychological well-being but also to a sense of belonging and self-esteem. Programs that reduce stigmatizing barriers and create genuine pathways to social integration are essential for this process. Social inclusion must address systemic inequities and provide equitable opportunities for individuals to participate meaningfully in their environments. In addition to social factors, legal and financial planning are essential components of lifelong care. Establishing mechanisms such as trusts, special funds, and legal protections ensures financial stability and safeguards the rights of individuals with intellectual disabilities. These measures empower individuals to achieve greater independence while alleviating the burden on families, who can rely on secure, long-term management strategies for their loved ones. Effective financial and legal planning provides a foundation for individuals to live with dignity and security, supported by a robust and sustainable care network. The concept of Quality of Life (QoL) plays a central role in lifelong care, reflecting the multidimensional nature of well-being. QoL encompasses both subjective experiences and objective conditions, capturing the dynamic interplay between personal aspirations and external environments.

Models such as Schalock and Verdugo Alonso's framework highlight core domains of QoL, including physical and emotional well-being, self-determination, interpersonal relationships, and social inclusion. These domains provide a comprehensive understanding of QoL and emphasize the importance of autonomy, access to resources, and meaningful community integration. For individuals with intellectual disabilities, aligning care practices with QoL constructs ensures that services address their unique needs and preferences while promoting dignity and self-determination. Lifelong care for individuals with intellectual disabilities requires adaptive strategies that integrate holistic planning, inclusive practices, and robust support frameworks. Independence and self-determination play a fundamental role in promoting individual functioning, QoL, and social inclusion, particularly for individuals with intellectual disabilities. These two factors are not only essential components of the QoL construct but also key goals to pursue for its improvement and maintenance. Self-determination, encompassing autonomy and competence, is particularly vital for achieving independence, as it enables individuals to set goals, make choices, and take control of their lives. Research has demonstrated that higher levels of self-determination are associated with improved adaptive behaviors, reduced problem behaviors, enhanced community participation, and greater motivation for learning (Ellenkamp et al., 2016; Mumbardò-Adam et al., 2023; Kuld et al., 2023). Independence, understood as the capacity to manage daily tasks autonomously, build social relationships, and engage in work life, significantly contributes to increased self-esteem and a deeper sense of social inclusion (Wehmeyer & Bolding, 2001). When individuals are supported in making decisions and taking charge of their lives, substantial improvements in self-confidence and personal fulfillment are observed. While closely interlinked, self-determination and independence have distinct yet complementary roles. Self-determination involves the ability to exercise choice, set personal goals, and assert control, reflecting an alignment with individual and social rights (Wehmeyer & Palmer, 2003).

Independence, conversely, focuses on living autonomously without excessive reliance on others, allowing individuals to navigate life on their own terms (O'Leary, 2017). Together, these elements are pivotal in fostering a sense of agency and enabling individuals to thrive within inclusive communities. By prioritizing and facilitating self-determination and independence, care strategies not only enhance quality of life but also promote the full exercise of individual and social rights.

This, in turn, supports the development of an inclusive society that values contributions and recognizes the potential of every individual. Integrating these principles within lifelong care underscores the transformative impact of an approach oriented toward quality of life for individuals with intellectual disabilities. By focusing on personalized care, equitable opportunities, and comprehensive service delivery, individuals with intellectual disabilities can achieve greater autonomy, improved quality of life, and meaningful participation in society. Bridging gaps between policy and practice remains an ongoing challenge, but a unified approach that incorporates QoL principles offers a pathway to dignity, inclusion, and empowerment for all individuals with intellectual disabilities.

An ecological perspective for achieving social inclusion outcomes

Social inclusion is a multifaceted concept influenced by the interplay between individuals and their social, cultural, and environmental contexts. An ecological approach to social inclusion shifts the focus from the individual alone to the broader systems that shape their experiences, emphasizing the interdependence of personal relationships, community structures, and societal norms. The comprehensive perspective, rooted in Bronfenbrenner's ecological systems theory (1979), provides a framework for understanding how various layers of an individual's environment contribute to or hinder their inclusion.

At the foundation of this approach lies the microsystem, which encompasses the immediate social environment, including family, friends, and close interpersonal relationships. These connections foster a sense of belonging and daily participation, laying the groundwork for inclusion.

The mesosystem extends this perspective by examining the interactions between different elements of the microsystem, such as the interplay between family support and community engagement. A robust mesosystem strengthens social inclusion through cohesive and interconnected support networks.

Moving outward, the exosystem represents broader social structures that indirectly influence the individual, such as local government policies, community organizations, and the availability of essential resources.

Access to inclusive services, reliable public transportation, and education programs within this layer significantly impacts an individual's ability to participate fully in society.

At the cultural and structural level, the macrosystem encompasses societal values, legal frameworks, and economic systems. This layer highlights the critical role of overarching attitudes, norms, and policies—such as anti-discrimination legislation and national disability rights strategies—in shaping opportunities for social inclusion.

Finally, the chronosystem adds the dimension of time, illustrating how changes in public policies, societal attitudes, or personal circumstances over an individual's lifespan affect their inclusion. For example, advancements in accessibility technology or shifting cultural attitudes toward diversity can profoundly alter the inclusion landscape.

This ecological approach underscores the need for multifaceted interventions that address barriers across all layers of the environment. Personal relationships must be supported alongside systemic reforms to dismantle discriminatory policies, reduce economic inequalities, and combat social stigma. By adopting this holistic perspective, policymakers, service providers, and communities can create environments that foster inclusive opportunities for individuals with disabilities in every aspect of life. Building on these principles, the Ecological Social Inclusion Model proposed by Simplican et al. (2015) extends this theoretical framework by incorporating specific environmental layers: the individual, interpersonal, organizational, community, and policy levels. This model emphasizes the interconnectedness of these layers and advocates for targeted strategies that address both immediate and structural barriers to social inclusion. By integrating individual aspirations with systemic solutions, the model provides a practical pathway to advancing social inclusion for individuals with intellectual and neurodevelopmental disabilities. Through this lens, inclusion is not merely a goal but a dynamic process requiring coordinated efforts at all levels of society.

Conclusion

This paper underscores the critical need to transition from institutionalized care models to community-based systems that prioritize autonomy, self-determination, and quality of life for individuals with intellectual disabilities.

While significant strides have been made in policy frameworks such as the CRPD and European Disability Strategy, the uneven implementation and systemic disparities across regions highlight the ongoing challenges. Effective social inclusion requires addressing barriers across multiple ecological layers, from strengthening personal relationships to enacting systemic reforms that dismantle discriminatory practices and ensure equitable access to resources. The findings emphasize that achieving meaningful inclusion is not solely about improving immediate care environments but also about fostering societal attitudes, enhancing community infrastructures, and adopting person-centered approaches in policy and service delivery. A unified, quality-of-life-oriented strategy is essential to empower individuals with intellectual disabilities to exercise their rights, build meaningful relationships, and participate fully in society. Policymakers and stakeholders must align strategies with international standards, such as the CRPD, to ensure that the rights of individuals with intellectual disabilities are upheld in practice. This involves prioritizing person-centered approaches, expanding funding for inclusive initiatives, and fostering interdisciplinary collaboration. By embedding quality of life principles into service delivery and policy frameworks, the pathway to meaningful inclusion becomes clearer. Future efforts must focus on integrating individual aspirations with systemic interventions, creating environments where individuals with intellectual disabilities can thrive. By advancing inclusive practices, promoting interdisciplinary collaboration, and aligning services with ecological and quality-of-life models, this study offers a pathway to foster dignity, inclusion, and empowerment for all individuals with disabilities.

References

- American Association on Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities. (2020). *Definition of Intellectual Disability*. Washington, D.C.: Author.
- Bronfenbrenner, U. (1979). *The ecology of human development: Experiments by nature and design*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Buntinx, W. H. E., & Schalock, R. L. (2010). Models of disability, quality of life, and individualized supports: Implications for professional practice in intellectual disability. *Journal of Policy and Practice in Intellectual Disabilities*, 7(4), 283–294.
- European Association of Service Providers for Persons with Disabilities. (2020). *Quality of Life and Inclusion in Community Services for People with Disabilities*. Brussels.
- European Commission. (2021). *European Strategy for the Rights of Persons with Disabilities 2021–2030*. Brussels: European Union.

American Association on Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities. (2020). Definition of Intellectual Disability. Washington, D.C.: Author.

Bronfenbrenner, U. (1979). *The ecology of human development: Experiments by nature and design*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Buntinx, W. H. E., & Schalock, R. L. (2010). Models of disability, quality of life, and individualized supports: Implications for professional practice in intellectual disability. *Journal of Policy and Practice in Intellectual Disabilities*, 7(4), 283–294.

European Association of Service Providers for Persons with Disabilities. (2020). *Quality of Life and Inclusion in Community Services for People with Disabilities*. Brussels.

European Commission. (2021). *European Strategy for the Rights of Persons with Disabilities 2021–2030*. Brussels: European Union.

European Council. (2023). *Disability in the EU: Facts and Figures*. Available online.

European Disability Forum. (2020). *Ensuring Dignity and Quality of Life for Persons with Intellectual Disabilities*. Brussels.

Inclusion Europe. (2019). *Support in the Community: Moving Beyond Institutions*. Brussels.

Mansell, J., Beadle-Brown, J., & Kozma, A. (2007). Deinstitutionalization and community living: Outcomes and costs. *Journal of Intellectual Disability Research*, 51(3), 193–204.

Mittler, P. (2015). Overcoming barriers to inclusion: An international perspective. *Journal of Disability Policy Studies*, 26(2), 63–68.

O’Leary, P. (2017). Independence and disability: A personal perspective. *Journal of Disability Studies*, 14(2), 89–96.

Ouellette-Kuntz, H., Lunsky, Y., Blinkhorn, A., Robinson, S., & Rajky, L. (2015). Beyond deinstitutionalization: Advancing towards an inclusive society. *Journal of Policy and Practice in Intellectual Disabilities*, 12(3), 171–178.

Schalock, R. L., & Verdugo Alonso, M. A. (2002). *Handbook on quality of life for human service practitioners*. Washington, DC: American Association on Mental Retardation.

Schalock, R. L., & Verdugo Alonso, M. A. (2012). Quality of life in the 21st century: Concepts and issues. *Journal of Intellectual Disability Research*, 56(2), 103–104.

United Nations. (2006). *Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD)*. United Nations Treaty Series, 2515(3), 3–30.

Wehmeyer, M. L., & Bolding, N. (2001). Self-determination across the life span: Independence and inclusion. *Education and Training in Mental Retardation and Developmental Disabilities*, 36(3), 208–216.

Wehmeyer, M. L., & Palmer, S. B. (2003). Promoting self-determination in students with disabilities. *Journal of the Association for Persons with Severe Handicaps*, 28(2), 110–119.

World Health Organization. (2019). *Guidelines on Mental Health, Human Rights and Legislation*. Geneva: WHO Press.



Ensuring Education for All: Legal Framework and the Monitoring of Out-of-School Children in Georgia

Author Note

Teona Diasamidze

**PhD Student, Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences, Iv.Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University
<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9793-1984> Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Teona Diasamidze 11a, Ilia Chavchavadze Avenue, Block 3, Tbilisi 0179, Georgia
Email: teona.diasamidze774@law.tsu.edu.ge**

Abstract

In 2020, Georgia implemented a legal framework for monitoring out-of-school children, aimed at ensuring mandatory education for children aged 6 to 16 years. This paper analyzes the effectiveness and challenges of the program during its first cycle, which ended in 2022, and discusses the revisions introduced in 2023. The program relies on data exchange between multiple state agencies and identifies children not enrolled in school or lacking an educational history. Key issues include inconsistencies in government coordination, the program's reliance on external social services, and the complexities posed by structural changes within state agencies. Our research examines whether the current monitoring cycles are adequate and whether the legal framework is equipped to justify its effectiveness, especially given the complete reorganization of responsible agencies. Findings highlight the systemic gaps, with 4,362 children still not enrolled, and question whether policy enforcement alone is sufficient for mandatory education. The paper concludes with policy recommendations to enhance the continuity and sustainability of monitoring efforts, ensuring the program's success in achieving long-term outcomes.

Keywords:

Education policy, out-of-school children, monitoring program, compulsory schooling

Introduction

Compulsory education is universally recognized for its foundational role in fostering social enforcing mandatory schooling. However, within just three years, substantial revisions were made to the program without a comprehensive evaluation of its initial implementation and outcomes. The absence of a thorough analysis raises concerns regarding whether sufficient time was passed to fully understand the causes of the problem or assess the effectiveness of the program. The 2023 revisions introduced significant changes, including the reorganization of government departments responsible for enforcement, leading to challenges in capacity building that hinder the program's effectiveness.

Furthermore, many key actors remain unaware of the program's legal framework, their specific responsibilities, or the means by which they can contribute to solving the issue of out-of-school children.

This study explores the implications of these policy changes, evaluates the gaps in program assessment, and addresses the broader need for coordinated enforcement to achieve universal compulsory education in Georgia.

The article is structured as follows to thoroughly analyze Georgia's monitoring program for out-of-school children, using existing literature, national legislation, and stakeholder perspectives.

Literature Review: This section reviews global and national contexts of compulsory education enforcement, incorporating academic studies, policy analyses, and reports, including the findings from the Public Defender of Georgia and other relevant research conducted in Georgia.

National Legislation and Policy Framework: A detailed discussion of Georgia's legal framework for compulsory education, including the 2020 State Program for Monitoring Out-of-School Children and its 2023 amendments, and their implications.

Methodology: This section outlines the research approach, including policy document analysis, interviews with key stakeholders such as heads of Education Resource Centers, and data from the Ministry of Education's Psychology Center.

Discussion: A thorough analysis of the findings in relation to the research questions, highlighting program gaps and areas for improvement.

Conclusions and Recommendations: A summary of key insights and practical recommendations to enhance the effectiveness of Georgia's monitoring program and ensure the successful reintegration of out-of-school children.

Literature Review

Compulsory education is integral to promoting economic growth, social mobility, and reducing inequality. Education builds human capital, contributing to societal development through higher income levels, reduced crime rates, and improved health outcomes. Key studies, such as the IZA World of Labor's research, show how changes in compulsory schooling laws lead to measurable improvements in economic outcomes, especially for marginalized groups like early school-leavers.

Internationally, there has been a general trend toward increasing the duration of compulsory education and raising the upper age limit for school-leaving. This trend is notably evident in OECD countries, where debates around the optimum age for compulsory schooling continue, with a focus on equity and its relation to socioeconomically disadvantaged groups. The equity of educational outcomes for vulnerable populations have gained attention. In Finland, the extension of compulsory education to the age of 18, implemented in 2021, aims to ensure equitable access to education, particularly for students at risk of marginalization. This policy is aligned with governmental goals to promote educational equality and prevent dropout, especially among young people (OECD, 2019). The UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS) and UNICEF's Global Initiative on Out-of-School Children (OOSC) provide frameworks to track educational exclusion. The OOSC framework identifies five key dimensions of exclusion, addressing children who are not enrolled in primary, secondary, or preschool education, or are at risk of dropping out due to factors like poverty, gender discrimination, or disability. These frameworks emphasize the need for data-driven interventions to address educational barriers.

International frameworks, such as Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4), which advocates for inclusive and equitable education for all by 2030, align with these initiatives. These frameworks are also mirrored in Finland's policy, which links educational reforms to the broader aim of promoting lifelong learning and societal welfare. Juusola (2023) explores the perceptions of young people regarding the extension of compulsory education, highlighting how such reforms can improve equity in education and the importance of considering students' lived experiences to better address educational exclusion.

The implementation of compulsory education is managed at the national level, aiming to ensure equitable access to education for all children. However, Georgia continues to face challenges in effectively addressing educational exclusion due to a lack of comprehensive research and complete statistical data, which is crucial for shaping policy.

Methodology

This study utilizes a mixed-methods approach to evaluate the effectiveness and challenges of Georgia's State Program for Monitoring Out-of-School Children. The research involves an analysis of policy documents, reports, and qualitative data gathered through interviews with key stakeholders involved in the program's implementation.

Document Analysis: The study reviews key national legislation, including the Law of Georgia on General Education, the State Program for Monitoring Out-of-School Children, and subsequent amendments. Reports from government bodies such as the Public Defender of Georgia and the Ministry of Education and Science were also reviewed.

Interviews: Semi-structured interviews were conducted with stakeholders such as heads of district Educational Resource Centers and social workers from the Ministry of Education's Psychosocial Center to gather insights into practical challenges, coordination issues, and the effectiveness of interventions.

Data Collection and Analysis: The study also reviews available statistical data on out-of-school children, including enrollment figures, demographic breakdowns, and outcomes of interventions. The analysis focuses on identifying patterns and areas needing improvement.

This approach provides a comprehensive understanding of the program's strengths and weaknesses, offering recommendations for future policy adjustments and implementation strategies.

Discussion

International research shows that any factor preventing a student from participating in the educational process is critical for the successful implementation of compulsory education. Identifying these factors and their underlying causes is essential for developing strategies to reduce school dropout rates and reintegrate out-of-school children into the education system (Rumberger, 2011). Moreover, understanding the legal implications of compulsory education is key to formulating effective policies aimed at reducing the number of out-of-school children (Baker & Milligan, 2008). Preventive programs that mitigate dropout risks must align with compulsory education policies, addressing specific circumstances to effectively reduce educational exclusion (Dynarski et al., 1998).

Adequate school resources and state policies that facilitate access to education for all students are critical determinants for the successful implementation of compulsory education (Glewwe et al., 2011).

In Georgia, the situation remains concerning. During the 2022-2023 academic year, 631,758 students were enrolled in general education institutions. However, the status of approximately 10,000 children remains unclear (Public Defender, 2022). The lack of regular updates to this data raises questions about its accuracy and reliability. Conducting thorough research into the causes of educational exclusion and generating comprehensive, up-to-date information remains a significant challenge in Georgia.

Achieving effective compulsory education requires the systematic collection and analysis of relevant data at the state level. However, the data published by Georgia's National Statistical Service (Sakstat) are limited, focusing mainly on students who discontinue their studies during the school year. In contrast, the UNESCO Institute for Statistics provides a broader range of data, including total enrollment figures, attendance rates, and educational levels by country, including Georgia (UNESCO, UIS.Stat). The systematic processing of this data into actionable insights can help identify the causes of educational exclusion and guide policy interventions.

In Georgia, a child who is out of school is defined as one who falls within the compulsory education age range (6 to 16 years) but has not been registered in the General Education Management Information System (Government of Georgia, 2020). The Law of Georgia on General Education prohibits the expulsion of students at primary and basic education levels, but specific circumstances can lead to the suspension of their student status, including long-term absenteeism or voluntary withdrawal (Government of Georgia, 2021).

The creation of the State Program for Monitoring the Identification of Out-of-School Children in 2021, in collaboration with UNICEF and the Bulgarian government, was Georgia's first comprehensive initiative to identify out-of-school children aged 6 to 16, assess their educational needs, and reintegrate them into the education system (Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia, 2021). According to the program, 10,404 children aged 6 to 16 were identified as out of school, with 1,863 enrolled in school by 2022. However, information on 4,362 children remains under review (Public Defender, 2022).

Despite these efforts, the lack of regularly updated, publicly accessible data on out-of-school children hinders the evaluation of program effectiveness and the development of targeted policies. A major challenge in the program's implementation is the frequent amendments to the underlying legislation, which complicate its execution and the training of personnel. This uncertainty undermines the strategic planning necessary to address the root causes of educational exclusion effectively.

The Ministry of Education and Science has been responsible for coordinating efforts to monitor out-of-school children since 2020. Social workers from the Psychosocial Center within the Ministry were tasked with identifying out-of-school children, gathering data, and informing parents about their children's right to education. However, interviews revealed that these practices had not been effectively documented or implemented, particularly in the Samtskhe-Javakheti and Shida Kartli regions. Despite submitting a formal request for data from the Ministry, insufficient information was received regarding the number of completed questionnaires or findings related to out-of-school children.

Additionally, public information requests for detailed statistics on out-of-school children, including age, gender, and geographical distribution, revealed that the data remains incomplete and outdated, further hindering efforts to address the issue effectively. According to Resolution No. 579, the Ministry is legally obligated to report this information, but delays in data compilation continue to impede the transparency of the monitoring process.

Conclusions and Recommendations

This study underscores the critical need for robust monitoring mechanisms to ensure that all children in Georgia, particularly those out of school, are reintegrated into the education system. The findings highlight persistent challenges in Georgia's State Program for Monitoring Out-of-School Children, particularly regarding the program's effectiveness, the timeliness of interventions, and the sustainability of the program amidst frequent reorganization of responsible agencies.

Key Findings:

Despite the legal framework established in 2020, significant gaps remain in the identification and reintegration of out-of-school children. As of 2022, over 4,300 children were still unaccounted for in the education system.

Frequent legislative amendments and a lack of coherent coordination among state agencies have impeded the program's effectiveness in monitoring and addressing the issue of out-of-school children.

Insufficient training and unclear distribution of responsibilities among key actors, such as social workers and educational resource centers, have limited the program's practical implementation.

The lack of regularly updated, publicly available data complicates the evaluation of the program's effectiveness and hinders the development of targeted, data-driven interventions.

Recommendations:

Based on the research findings, the following recommendations are proposed:

Improve Coordination and Clarify Roles: Establish clear roles and responsibilities across government agencies involved in the program. This would enhance inter-agency collaboration and streamline efforts to identify and reintegrate out-of-school children.

Strengthen Capacity Building: Prioritize capacity-building efforts for social workers and other frontline staff to ensure they are adequately trained in implementing the monitoring program. This includes comprehensive training on the legal framework, data collection, and intervention strategies.

Enhance Data Transparency and Regular Updates: The Ministry of Education and Science should ensure the regular publication of comprehensive data on out-of-school children. This data should be disaggregated by age, gender, geographical location, and reasons for exclusion. Public access to accurate and up-to-date data is essential for monitoring progress and guiding policy decisions. Collaboration with the Social Services Agency and other government entities will be critical in developing and enhancing mechanisms to identify out-of-school children and ensuring that statistics are updated annually, providing an accurate and current understanding of the situation.

Strengthen Policy Enforcement and Raise Awareness: While legal frameworks have been established, more robust enforcement mechanisms are needed, alongside greater awareness among local authorities and stakeholders about the legal requirements and responsibilities associated with compulsory education. Effective communication and awareness campaigns would help ensure broader participation and adherence to the program.

By addressing these key areas, Georgia can enhance the sustainability and success of its efforts to ensure all children have access to compulsory education, thereby contributing to the long-term social and economic development of the country.

References

- UN General Assembly. (1948, December 10). Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 217 A (III). Retrieved from <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3712c.html>
- UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO). (1960, December 14). Convention Against Discrimination in Education. Retrieved from <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3880.html>
- UNESCO. (2011). Education for people and planet: Creating sustainable futures for all.
- UNESCO. (2023). SDG 4 mid-term progress review: Progress since 2015 has been far too slow(ED/GEM/MRT/2023/FS/G/2). Retrieved from <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000386852>
- Parliament of the Republic of Georgia. (1995, August 24). Constitution of Georgia (No. 786). Retrieved from <https://matsne.gov.ge/ka/document/view/30346?publication=36>
- UNICEF. (2019). Child marriage, child labor, and schooling in South Asia.
- UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS). <http://data.uis.unesco.org/Index.aspx>.
- Public Defender of Georgia. (2023). Report on the state of protection of human rights and freedoms in Georgia. Retrieved from <https://ombudsman.ge/geo/saparlamento-angarishebi>
- President of Georgia. (2000, March 2). Decree No. 80 on approval of the State Program for the Protection, Development, and Adaptation of Minors to Society. Retrieved from <https://www.matsne.gov.ge/ka/document/view/113602?publication=0>
- Public Defender of Georgia. (2022). Report on the state of protection of human rights and freedoms in Georgia. Retrieved from <https://ombudsman.ge/geo/saparlamento-angarishebi>
- Government of Georgia. (2020, September 10). Resolution No. 573 on approval of the State Program for Monitoring Out-of-School Children. Retrieved from <https://matsne.gov.ge/ka/document/view/4992004?publication=0>
- Minister of Education and Science of Georgia. (2017, January 11). Order No. 04/N on approval of the rules for enrolling a student in a general educational institution and suspending the student's status. Retrieved from <https://matsne.gov.ge/ka/document/view/3543464?publication=0>
- Parliament of Georgia. (2005, April 8). Law of Georgia on General Education (No. 1330). Retrieved from <https://matsne.gov.ge/ka/document/view/29248?publication=99>
- Aikman, S., & Unterhalter, E. (2005). Beyond access: Transforming policy and practice for gender equality in education. Oxfam.
- Baird, S., Ferreira, F. H., Özler, B., & Woolcock, M. (2011). Conditional, unconditional, and everything in between: A systematic review of the effects of cash transfer programmes on schooling outcomes. *Journal of Development Effectiveness*, 3(1), 1-43.
- Birch, E., & Gielen, U. P. (2010). Economic development, political democracy, and human development. *Comparative Political Studies*, 43(7), 835-861.
- Baker, M., & Milligan, K. (2008). Evidence from compulsory schooling laws. *Economic Journal*, 118(525), 1045-1076.
- Bruns, B., Mingat, A., & Rakotomalala, R. (2003). Achieving universal primary education by 2015: A chance for every child. World Bank.
- Chu, J. (2017). Poverty, parent education, and provision of universal primary education: A cross-national study of 109 countries. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 52, 37-49.
- Diasamidze, T. (2024). Issues related to the organization of compulsory education in Georgia. In P. Gibbs & G. Tavadze (Eds.), *Proceedings of the National Doctoral Scientific Conference (2023)* (pp.91-103). EAST EUROPEAN UNIVERSITY.

- Dynarski, S., Gleason, P., Rangarajan, A., & Woodworth, K. (1998). Impacts of dropout prevention programs: A review of the literature. *Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness*, 1(1), 5–30.
- Duflo, E. (2001). Schooling and labor market consequences of school construction in Indonesia: Evidence from an unusual policy experiment. *American Economic Review*, 91(4), 795–813.
- Glewwe, P., Hanushek, E. A., Humpage, S., & Ravina, R. (2011). School resources and educational outcomes in developing countries: A review of the literature from 1990 to 2010. National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Glewwe, P., Jacoby, H. G., & King, E. M. (2001). Early childhood nutrition and academic achievement: A longitudinal analysis. *Journal of Public Economics*, 81(3), 345–368.
- Glick, P., & Sahn, D. E. (2000). Schooling of girls and boys in a West African country: The effects of parental education, income, and household structure. *Economics of Education Review*, 19(1), 63–87.
- Hall, A. (2012). Mobilising communities for girls' education: Experiences in Malawi. *Gender and Development*, 20(2), 231–243.
- Juusola, H. (2023). What do young people think about the extension of compulsory education? *Educational Research*, 65(4), 478–495. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131881.2023.2263885>
- Oosterhoff, P., Zwanikken, P., & Ketting, E. (2008). Sexual torture of boys in detention in Burundi: A report by the health and human rights program, School of Public Health and Community Medicine, University of Washington.
- Psacharopoulos, G. (1997). Child labor versus educational attainment: Some evidence from Latin America. *Journal of Population Economics*, 10(4), 377–386.
- Rumberger, R. W. (2011). *Dropping out: Why students drop out of high school and what can be done about it*. Harvard University Press.



4

Book Review “Overcoming the Past: A Global History of Ukraine”



Author Note

Vasyl Buzhak

The University of York Europe Campus

“Overcoming the Past: A Global History of Ukraine” by Yaroslav Hrytsak was published in 2021. Later it became one of the main and popular books on the history of Ukraine, which actualizes past events in the context of the Russian-Ukrainian war. Dr. Yaroslav Hrytsak, a well-known Ukrainian historian, professor at Ukrainian Catholic University and honorary professor at “Kyiv Mohyla Academy”, describes himself as a public intellectual, emphasizing his mission "in discovering Ukraine to the world and the world to Ukraine". The English translation of the book was published in 2023 by the British publishing house Sphere with the title "Ukraine. The Forging of a Nation".

In the book’s introduction, Yaroslav Hrytsak explains his preferred method of writing Ukrainian history, revealing his author's approach in the book's narration. There are 4 criteria for the author: history without names and dates; brevity; global context; and the concept of "longue durée". Professor Hrytsak explains that events and surnames require relevant interpretation and causal analysis. Identifying and understanding patterns and connections between certain events is more important than knowing a list of facts. The focus should be on 'Why?' rather than 'What?'. Works by Andreas Kappeler, and Roman Szporluk, and essays by Ivan Lysiak Rudnytsky are prime examples of Ukrainian history, according to Professor Hrytsak. They are the best because they are concise and accurate. Hrytsak's book can be described as an essay series, that is easy and engaging to read because of its vivid metaphors, interesting comparisons, and bright examples. The book contains 6 main chapters describing the history of Ukraine from antiquity to the present as follows: "What is in the title?"; "Rus"; "Cossack Ukraine"; "The Long 19th Century"; "Ukraine, 1914-1945"; "Post-war Ukraine."

The book is notable because it tries to connect global (not even regional) events to historical processes in Ukraine, and the author applies tools from the French Annales School to build long historical trends and patterns. Yaroslav Hrytsak uses the optics of a telescope, not a microscope, applying an interdisciplinary approach. Wide usage of rich statistical data in tables, charts, maps or matrices helps the reader see and understand important (sometimes not obvious) interconnections and trends. Another interesting narrative approach is the placement of special chapters that describe the important phenomenon or events for a better understanding of the social context of the forging of the Ukrainian nation.

These are a brief history of Ukrainian bread, Ukrainian song, Ukrainian borderland, violence, and the Ukrainian language.

One of the interesting examples of the author's picturing and interpretations of significant events is his comparisons and case study method. For example, contrasting Rus with the Carolingian Empire, analyzing the long-term consequences of the adoption of Christianity not from Rome, but from Constantinople (later Moscow's orbit as the "third Rome") that caused the ambiguous heritage of Rus and its "long shadow" (which will be used by Tsardom of Moscow and its heirs up to modern Russia).

The author explains how the geographical discoveries of Christopher Columbus influenced the socio-economic situation in the Ukrainian lands and contributed to the spread of the Cossack movement; why poets and writers in Ukraine played the role of politicians, and why Ukrainian literature was a manifestation of political ideas (the phenomenon of "Literary Ukraine"); what alternatives and risks existed for forming of the state in 1918 and 1991 as a project for all Ukrainians; why the Ukrainian nation was born in 1914, post-war Ukraine became a country without a past or "Nowhere Land", and why Euromaidan in 2013 became the Revolution of Dignity in 2014. The author interprets these and other events in the spirit of 'large structures, long-term processes, and ambitious comparisons' (Charles Tilly. *Big Structures, Large Processes, Huge Comparisons*. New York, 1984).

Identity, self-identification, and values are the cross-cutting issues the author explains in the book. What would be the answer to the question "Who are you?" or "Where are you from?" at different times among the different representatives of the population? What was the perception of Ukrainians among the main neighbours - Poles and Russians, and vice versa? Other key concepts for Hrytsak's history are tradition and modernity, as well as analysis of the transformation from traditional communities to modern society, from the folklore of villages to the culture of cities, from agrarian to post-industrial society. It is important to understand the evolution of the Ukrainian "stateless people" to the state nation and the features of this path. According to the author: "A nation is the child of a marriage between modern state and folk culture" or "No nation - no modernization." Explaining the identity issues, Prof. Hrytsak introduces the concept of multiple modernities and its examples on the Ukrainian territory.

In the last chapter, ‘Instead of Ending: Ukraine – Do It Yourself,’ Professor Hrytsak gives a 4-step strategy for building a successful state, focusing on the role of values. Professor Hrytsak explains Inglehart -Wetzel's cultural map of the world and Ukraine's place in it, as well as the drivers that moved the country in the right direction despite its ‘triple curse’ (an Orthodox country that was part of the Russian Empire and ‘experienced one of the wildest forms of communism’). Thus, the book offers a modern and complex view of the past in a global context without illusions and stereotyping. It gives an understanding of the deep causes and consequences to come to appropriate conclusions for building a successful future. This is the recipe for ‘overcoming the history’ from Yaroslav Hrytsak.

(Ярослав Грицак. “Подолати минуле: глобальна історія України”. Київ: Портал, 2022).



CONSORTIO
Scientific Journal



5

For the Comparative Analysis of the Historical Materials of the European Catholic Missionaries and the Georgian Historian of the 18th Century

CONSORTIO
Scientific Journal

Author Note

Dodo Nadiradze

**PhD Student of Sokhumi State University
№ 61, Ana Politovskaya Str., 0186, Tbilisi, Georgia**

Abstract

We are able to restore the picture of the past from various information obtained from different written sources, however, during the research, we have to consider the information critically provided from such source. The trustworthiness of the source must be assessed in order to determine the veracity of historical facts. This is done by analyzing and synthesizing source information. Based on the comparative study of the records preserved in the work “Tskhovreba Mepeta” (Lives of Kings) by Georgian historian, Sekhnia Chkheidze, residing at the turn of XVII-XVIII centuries, they are compared with the data of the Catholic missionaries of the XVII-XVIII centuries and other European authors, their reliability is verified and respective conclusions are developed. The discussed records prove and fill the same historical developments and reconstruct a complete historical picture of the epoch. Sekhnia Chkheidze is the historian acting on the political and military fields of Georgia and Iran in XVII-XVIII cc. And his works are a non-stop list of the historical developments, therefore, clarifying the reliability of his reports is the most important issue of Georgian source studies.

The historical value of the works by Sekhnia Chkheidze lies in the author's attitude towards historical events: he did not use written primary sources, but described what he witnessed himself or used the narration of direct eyewitnesses.

Keywords: Historian, Sekhnia Chkheidze, XVII-XVIII centuries, European sources, Historical works, historical developments, reliability of sources.

Introduction

A complete historical and source study of the works by Georgian historian Sekhnia Chkheidze from the end of the XVII century and the first third of the XVIII century has not been carried out so far. Such a “delay” is partially caused by the attitude of Great Ivane Javakishvili towards the reliability of the records by Sekhnia. Our goal is to specify the issue of the reliability of the author based on comparing of the information provided by the Georgian and foreign authors of the respective epoch with the records provided in the “Tskhovreba Mepeta” by Sekhnia Chkheidze.

The records of the Europeans, especially European Missionaries, are very important historical sources about the history of our country. European missionaries observed the historical processes in Georgia for several centuries and including XIII-XVIII centuries. Georgia had the relationship with many Franciscans, Dominican, and later, with Theatine and Capuchin friars over these centuries.

From the 60s of the XVII century, a new dynamic process began in the traditional bilateral religious-diplomatic relationship between the Holy See and Georgia, which continued with more or less intensity until the middle of the XIX century...

The primary concern of the missionaries was the spread of Catholicism among the population of Georgia. By the edict of June 13, 1661, St. Congregation "De Propaganda Fide" was established to carry out these duties in Georgia, and the Capuchin Order missionaries began their work there in 1663.

At first, the Capuchin friars settled in Tbilisi. They somehow continued the activity of the Theatine Fathers in Eastern Georgia ceased in 1638. This time, like the Theatinians, the Capuchin missionaries became a kind of diplomatic channel connecting with the West, because they, in addition to the Holy See, could help Georgian politicians establish diplomatic contacts with other European countries. It had a vital importance for the Georgian kingdom-principalities separated from Europe, having extremely limited connections with the group of the Western states, as the breakthrough of political isolation and introduction of advanced Western scientific and technical ideas in the country was possible only with support of missionaries. (Papashvili, Mamistvalishvili, Gamezardashvili, 2018:5).

The research compares the records by Sekhnia Chkheidze with the ones of Catholic Missionaries, Giuseppe Anatonio Romano, Giustino da Livorno, translator of the French ambassador to Iran Joseph Kartveli, French historian of the XVIII century Louis Andre de la Mamie - with reports of Clerac, Polish Catholic missionary, traveler and chronicler Jan Tadeusz Krushinski, English philanthropist and traveler John Hanway by the synthesis and analysis method of the sources.

Research Methodology: In the process of working on the paper, the comparative method of historical research is applied, which involves finding cause-and-effect relationships, presenting the main characteristics of the processes and their analysis, comparing the data of primary sources in order to draw a common conclusion.

Based on the cyclic study, content analysis and synthesis of European and Georgian historical sources of the 18th century, the paper confirms the reliability of the chronicle of the Georgian historian of the 18th century.

Literature Review: Ivane Javakhishvili, the founder of modern Georgian historiography, was one of the first to study the 18th century Georgian chronicler Sekhnia Chkheidze's historical work "The Life of Kings" (Javakhishvili, 1977:362-363). He had a skeptical attitude towards the reliability of this chronicle, but scientists and historians of the following period Valerian Gabashvili, Eldar Mamistvalishvili, Ilia Tabaghua, Murman Papashvili and others often rely on the references of Sekhnia Chkheidze's works (Gabashvili, 1955; Mamistvalishvili, 2019; Tabaghua, 1979; Papashvili, 1995). Therefore, our goal is to study in detail the chronicle of Sekhnia Chkheidze and prove that it is a reliable historical source. In the present article, the issue is discussed in one specific direction - European sources and historical references of Sekhnia Chkheidze's works are compared. The study of the reliability of Sekhnia Chkheidze's historical chronicle is a novelty in Georgian historiography.

Results and Discussion. In the second part of the XVII century Capuchin missionaries worked successfully in Tbilisi. Both Vakhtang V Shahnavazi (1658-1675) and Queen Mariam Dadiani helped and protected them (Tamarashvili, 1902:223; Papashvili, 1995:202). The Capuchin missionary of this period, Giuseppe Anatonio Romano in his field report sent from Tbilisi to St. Congregation "De Propaganda Fide" to one of the cardinals on December 1, 1675 (the letter is written in Italian. The text was translated and the introduction and remarks were attached by Murman Papashvili, Eldar Mamistvalishvili and Zurab Gamezardashvili) writes „It is about a year since the prince Erekle (Erekle I, the King of Kartli) (1688-1703)), the grandson of Teimuraz known for the Pope court, had returned from Moscow and went to Iran by instigation of the latter where he asked to the king to put him at the head of his state, where Archil, his brother-in-law, was.

At the instigation of the latter, he went to Iran, where he asked the king to put him at the head of his state (in 1674, Erekle Batonishvili, having been promised the throne by the shah of Iran, returned from Russia to Kakheti, where his son-in-law Archil reigned.

The latter knew that Shah Suleihman I (1666-1694) supported to Erekle and he arrange an extraordinary meeting to him...and sent him to Iran. Here Erekle spent 12 years, converted to Islam and was named Nazarali Khan).

Meantime, suspicion arose about the conspiracy of the viceroy of the country (meaning the kingdom of Kartli), the opponent of the mentioned prince (Vakhtang V), who did not enjoy sympathy among the Persians; He expelled his two sons (the sons of Vakhtang V, Archil and Luarsab), who ruled the largest provinces of Georgia from the domain of the great lord (**Papashvili, Mamistvalishvili, Gamezardashvili, 2018: 80**).

There would be many common and important issues if we compare the data of missionary Giuseppe Anatonio Romano with the writings by Sekhnia Chkheidze. „In 1666 the king Archil did not care on Kakheti, neither on family, when left Imereti and moved to Ossetia.... The Shanavaz king received the order from the Khan about seizing. He attacked Kakheti, Erekle could not resist, Erekle couldn't stand it anymore, got tired, went to Khan in Shirvan. King Shahnaoz reigned that time and they began to denunciate about departure of King Archil, and the king summoned King Shahnaoz. (**Sekhnia,1913:8**).

Georgian chronicler of that period describes the historical facts correctly, the fight of Vakhtang V against Erekle I, he also indicates about the complicated situation of Shahnavaz both in his own royal court, as well as with the Shah of Iran. A missionary missionary Giuseppe Anatonio Romano refers in his report sent from Gori to the contact person of St. Congregation „De Prpaganda Fide“on April 1, 1677 notes that „Local vice-roy (Vakhtang V) has recently died, who was poisoned by Persions ... This state (i.e. Georgia) will be shaken by strikes, uprisings and wars (**Papashvili, Mamistvalishvili, Gamezardashvili, 2018: 90**). We have mentioned in the previous chapter that we consider more reliable the reports preserved in Georgian sources, according to which the king of Kartli fell ill on the way and could not reach Isfahan.. (Kakabadze, 1926:67, Chkheidze, 1913:9, Vakhushti, 1913:85). It seems that there were rumors among the people about the poisoning of the king of Kartli, since his sudden death caused in the territory of Iran (**Natroshvili, 1991:421**). Shahnavaz is buried in Qum, where his father Rostom King rested.

There is another interesting story in the letter written by the Georgian missionary Giustino da Livorno to the Cardinal of the Congregation "De Propaganda Fide" on December 22, 1686, „Because of the agreement I had with the principal (meaning King George XI of Kartli) and his nobles regarding their conversion to our faith and union with our church.. This time he (George XI) is preparing to receive the holy secret (**Papashvili, Mamistvalishvili, Gamezardashvili, 2018: 136,141**). We obtained quite a lot of information about the relations of King Giorgi XI of Kartli with Rome. When he was in epistolary relationship with Pope Innocent XI, as indicated in the correspondence with the Pope published by M. Tamarashvili (**Tamarashvili, 1902:263-273**). Reportedly, exactly at this time the king officially accepted Islam (since 1677). From the missionary's report, it can be seen that there was an agreement with the king and his dignitaries about converting to Catholicism and uniting with the Roman Church, but according to the same Pater, King Giorgi accepted Islam for more than nine years, just to maintain his reign (**Tamarashvili, 1902:264**). It is the time when Giorgi XI is rebelled against Shah of Iran and all the efforts are being made to free the country from Persian domination, but in order to take drastic steps, it was necessary to find a reliable ally in Europe. From the letters sent to the Pope, it appears that the king was waiting for the Pope's order. Giustino also asked the Pope: "This order should be such that the king of Iran does not get offended, because he (George XI) has not been in a good relationship with him for several years" (**Tamarashvili, 1902: 266**). Regarding to Giustino, one more information is important, where Pader talks about the influence of the Kingdom of Kartli in the Caucasus: "I myself have seen and read the letters sent by the king of Persia many times, where he calls George the crowned king. Indeed, this is more powerful and glorious than all other Georgian principals (George XI is meant). This is obeyed not only by the Amazons, but also by the Circassians themselves, from whom a large force of warriors can be drawn during a war (**Tamarashvili, 1902: 265**). Sekhnia also refers to the relationship between the Circassians and the Kartli kingdom: "The daughter of the Circassian lord, Rusudan was engaged to the Prince Bagrat " (**Sekhnia, 1913:15**). Bagrat, the only heir of Giorgi XI, died in Herat in Iran, and Vakhtang Batonishvili married his bride Rusudan according to the will of King: „The Prince Vakhtang went there, he had the wedding with the Rusudan, the daughter of Circassian Lord in Kharageuli, Imereti“ (**Sekhnia, 1913:32**). In 1723, when Vakhtang VI was forced to leave the kingdom of Kartli, the king of Circasian hosted the son-in-law going to Russia with honor,“

In the same time, King Vakhrang from Racha went to the house of the Circassian Lord, as a relative and he was respectfully hosted by the king of Circassian, relevant to the country's tradition“ (**Sekhnia,1913:62**). According to the sources, it is shown the tradition of benevolent attitude towards North Caucasian people was inherited from Georgian king to king.

It is interesting why Georgian chronicler, Sekhnia Chkheidze did not describe the relationship of king Giorgi with the Catholic Missionarie. In our opinion, King Giorgi XI appears as a continuation of the politics of the kings of Kartli of the XVII century with the Roman Church, as evidenced by the almost identical content of the letters sent by Giustino and Livorno to the Pope. During the confrontation with Iran, the king of Kartli needed to fix the Pope's position towards Iran. At the end of the XVII century, the complicated political condition of the Eastern Georgia (strike against Sefian Persia, confrontation between Giorgi XI and Erekle II, etc.) made Georgian king to find solution of the problem by establishing a relationship with Europe, and in particular with the Pope. Kings often recognized Catholicism formally and secretly from Iran, to get support from the Pope or some Christian state.

The letter of King George XI sent to the Pope was translated into Italian by the missionary Pater Giustine of Livorno, where the great expectation of the king can be clearly seen: "The Georgian Nobels are ready and we are waiting for your order" (**Tamarashvili, 1902:268**). Pope and „De Propaganda Fide“ sent the response to the king, in which they commended their zeal for the strengthening of the Catholic faith, and also gave good recommendation. Despite the great merits and activities, these diplomatic actions of the missionaries indicated only friendly relations and could not discuss the political aspect...

In the XVII-XVIII centuries it was clear the true attitude of Georgia kings and principals and the church of Georgia to the Church of the Rome, and double standards of the politicians – favoring Catholicism in diplomatic relations with Catholic countries, though persecution and harassment of Catholics inside of country (**Mamistvalishvili,2014:399**), therefore, while waiting for military aid from the West, Georgian politicians considered it possible to have a Catholic mission and even maintain a certain connection with Europe on religious grounds depending on the political situation, sometimes it was quite strong, and sometimes it was on the verge of cancellation (**Lomsadze, 1979:8**).

The motive of King Giorgi's acceptance of Islam with its accompanying political consequences was understandable to the Orthodox population. It was also important that there already was a certain tradition of rule by Muslim kings. In such a condition he could not refuse from Islam openly, as it was connected to improvement of the relationship with Shah.

It is noteworthy, that though the court of the Shah later also came out as a defender of Catholics in Georgia, due to a political ground, but it could not allow the Catholic king on the throne of Kartli. Shah Suleiman I (1666-1694), even in case of the tense relationship with the King of Kartli, could not allow George to surrender his kingdom to the Pope. Therefore, it can be said with certainty that the king of Kartli did not seriously intend to take such a step. The promises expressed by him in his letters did not go beyond the royal court, and together with the promises and letters sent by his predecessor kings, they were stored in the Vatican archives without results (**Mamistvalishvili, 2019:190-191**). At the royal court of Kartli, it was well understood that behind the Catholic missionaries was the Pope of Rome, one of the most influential political figures in the Western Europe, whose word was important in Eastern politics. Therefore, it is not surprising that they dreamed of military, political and financial assistance in Georgia as well.

Tamarashvili considered the next XVIII century relatively unsuccessful from the point of view of the work of the missionaries. The researcher cites the political situation, Persian domination and constant warlikeness, as well as Armenian enmity as the reasons for it (**Tamarashvili, 1902:301**). In 1724 after departure of King Vakhtang VI to Russia, the Orthodox parish was left almost without a patron (the clergy also followed the king). Catholic priests helped and comforted ordinary people as much as possible (**Favlenishvili, 2019:33**). It is true that the Pope could not provide anything but moral support, but such support instilled a spark of hope to Georgian politicians engaged in an unequal struggle with Muslims (**Pazhava, 2022:26**).

According to the letters of Catholic missionaries, Catholicism was accepted not only by the kings and princes of the country, but also by a certain part of the highest clergy, although E. Mamistvalishvili makes an interesting conclusion in relation to this issue and declares, that it is hard to name even one Georgian clergyman who became Catholic and then did anything for promotion and strengthening of this belief.

He considers their recognition of Catholicism partly suspicious, however, in case of existence, he directly connects such an action with a certain political motive and states that this fact was often kept secret and was unknown to the local Orthodox population (**Mamistvalishvili, 2019:194**).

Accordingly, the western orientation of the Georgian kings was considered one of the most reliable ways to save the country from the Muslim encirclement and was aimed at solving military-political issues. Safavid Iran did not take this relationship seriously, as it knew well that Europe would not provide a real support to Georgian that time.

Iran hindered entrance of missionaries to Georgia, but it could not stop linkages. In addition Georgian establishes diplomatic, religious and cultural relationship with support of the western missionaries and introduces with their achievements (**Pazhava, 2022:35**).

The works composed by the foreigners are as important as the narrative sources of socio-economic and political history of Safavid state (1501-1722) composed in the Persian language itself; if in Iran of the XVI-XVII centuries many primary historical works were produced in Persian language, there is no important historical work available in Persian at the end of the XVII century and the first quarter of the XVIII century. It is not an accidental. Along with the overall political, economic and cultural decline of the Safavid state, the poverty of Persian sources is due to the difficult political situation created in Iran during this period (**Gobejishvili, 1973:78**). That is why both Western European and Georgian sources are important for the history of Iran of this period. Moreover, when the authors of these writings had to stay at the court of the Shah of Iran for a long time, and most of them described the events they witnessed personally in their sources. This is what makes work of Georgian historian Sekhnia Chkheidze „Tskhovreba Mepeta“ especially important, providing rich information about the processes taking place at the Persian court of the Safavids at the end of the XVII century and the first quarter of the XVIII century.

One part of European missionaries similar to Sekhnia Chkheidze, lived in Iran for a long time and they described the histories witnessed by themselves personally. During study of reliability of the records of „Tskhovreba Mepeta“ by Sekhnia Chkheidze the synthesis of the sources described in the records (1653-1739) both of Catholic missionaries and other European authors, is important as the analysis based on the specific facts will increase the value of the work „Tskhovreba Mepeta“ by Sekhnia as the primary historical source.

Sekhnia Chkheidze was a contemporary of the Sefavid Iran „Age of Disorder“ and witness and participant of some developments. We get brief biographical information about the historian's presence in Iran from his own source: for the first time in Isfahan, he accompanied Giorgi XI and Kaikhosro Batonishvili in 1696: „A memandar and a figure of mercy came from Khan to Kaikhosro, the son of the King, they sent him off with honor, but he was accompanied by only a few men, by Chkheidze Sekhnia and a few nobles“ (Sekhnia,1913:16). Sekhnia being on the royal court of Shah together with Georgian princes says, that „Sekhnia Chkheidze did not want to get rid of them, she was raised by Levan herself and was raised together with Kaokhosro“. (Sekhnia,1913:17). Sekhnia participated alongside them in suppressing the Afghan-Baluchi rebellion. In 1699, he actively fought against the Baluchis in the Kirman desert. Batonishvili Levan, who was Kirmani's deputy at that time, led two hundred selected Kyzilbash soldiers, "made Chkheidze Sekhnia as a leader and no longer (he went himself) led two hundred selected Tatar troops, bypassed in the Manizhavi gorge, and started shooting" (Sekhnia,1913:23). In 1703 he accompanied Levan Batonishvili, who was appointed as a Janishin to Kartli, in 1704 Levan sent Beglarbeg Giorgi of Kandahar to the king, and Sekhnia stayed there until 1707: They were ten in [1704] Mdivanbeg sent a gift to his brother King Giorgi. He sent Chkheidze Sekhnia, as he was experienced and he knew about his country“ (Sekhnia,1913: 35). In order to suppress the rebellion in the Sefavid Iran capital in 1707 Sekhnia stands next to the Kaikhosro Batonishvili: „He took Sekhnia with him as a herald, we were going for twelve days the way of forty days“ (Sekhnia,1913:39). In 1707-1712 Sekhnia Chkheidze is in Georgia again, he tells us the stories of Kartli kingdom in the first person: „We reached Shanbiani... our master (Vakhtang Janishini) himself killed three ones by a gun, we were very happy, and sat for feasting“ (Sekhnia,1913:42). In 1712 Sekhnia Chkheidze accompanied Vakhtang VI at the Shah court and stayed there until 1714: „There was Avalishvili Zaza, the treasurer Ssekhnia, Tsitsishvili Bagrat, Secretary Giorgi... time passed and the Tatars were sent and they asked to give Kartli. As Batonishvili Vakhtang did not leave the belief of his ancestors, the prince was suppressed very much in 1714“ (Sekhnia,1913:48). In 1714-1722 Sekhnia was already in Kartli as a chief royal treasurer . In 1722 Vakhtang VI sent a chief royal treasurer to Tabriz, to Shah Tamaz, where in 1723 „Chkhiedze Sekhnia treasurer was arrested and captivated“ and Kartli was given to the king of Kakheti Kostantine (Mamad Kulikhan) (Sekhnia,1913:57).

It seems that Sekhnia was released quite soon as he still continued description of ongoing developments of Georgia, though he did not tell anything about himself, therefore, the last years of his life is not clear.

The work by Sekhnia Chkheidze reads the history of Giorgi XI in Afganistan and the same historical developments are found in one more historical source, in the Memories of Ioseb Kartveli, the translator of French Ambassador in Iran and a famous diplomat, which are preserved in the Hunter Library of Glazgow University. Ioseb Kartveli is famous both in foreign and Georgian historiography. In 1717-1723 he was the translator of France Consulate in Isfahan, when he returned to Costantinople.

Many author wrote about activities of Ioseb Kartveli (the French ambassador in Constantinople D. Andrezel of that time, Tadeusz Kruszynski , L. A. de la Mamy de Clerac, J. Hanway, S. Gillanents, T. H. Weir, D. M. Lang, V. Gabashvili, L. Lockart, T. Natroshvili, M. Gobejishvili, I. Tabaghua, G. Paichadze and etc.). This "memoir" of Ioseb Kartveli contains 58 handwritten pages. It included a brief history of Afghan tribes, the rule of Shah Abbas II in Kandahar, the rule of Kartli king Giorgi XI (called Gurgin Khan in foreign literature) in Kandahar, Revolt of the Afghan tribes against the Persian domination, the murder of Giorgi by the leader of the Afghan tribes Mirwais (1709), the death of the second Georgian king - Kaikhosro in the battles of Kandahar (1711), The rule of Mir Mahmud, the son of Mirwais, in Kandahar, and then his campaign against Persia, the conquest of Isfahan, etc. (**Tabaghua, 1979: 150**).

The content of the works by Ioseb Georgian, preserved in the Glasgow University Library, was published in English with some comments by English Professor T.H. Weir (**WEIR, 1922 :480-490**). At the end of the description of the Turkish manuscript, Weir notes that the content of Ioseb Kartveli's works is the same as the contents of four books by M. Clairac "History of Persia" and volume III of Hanway's works. Weir highlights the condition that John Ganway whose work was published in 1753 considers the work of Kruszynski as its own source, but Hanway, an author continues, is so much linked with the relevant places of the work by M. Clairac with its words and phrases, where the latter follows the text of Iosef Kartveli, that there should be the close relationship between Kruszynski and Ioseb Kartveli (**Gabashvili,1955:116**).

In order to study the reliability of the work by Sekhnia Chkheidze the "History of Persia" by the XVIII century French writer Louis André de la Mamie Clerc includes important information for us. Tadeusz Kruszynski was a Jesuit prosecutor in Isfahan from 1702, and in his report a large part is devoted to Afghan uprisings and invasions. Kruszynski also tells quite extensively about Georgians working in Iran, such as Giorgi XI, Kaikhosro and others. He is an eyewitness of these events, so his source is very valuable for us (Gabashvili,1955:117). Therefore, it would be easy for Krushinski to have access to information about Ioseb Kartveli, so it is understandable that the researchers noted the similarities between Krushinski and Ioseb Georgian, the works by M. Clerc and Hanway. English Hanway's writings hold a special place among the European primary sources for getting to know the period that is interesting to us, as at the time, the researcher of Georgian-Persian relations - Makar Khubua already compared the reports brought by Hanway and the "Tskhovreba Mepeta" by Georgian historian Sekhnia Chkheidze's, in particular, the episodes of the Georgian battle in Afghanistan. Based on this analysis, it is clear that both are completely independent works, the authors' references are distinguished by a rare identity for an objective analysis of the situation. In particular, Among the leaders of the Afghan tribes, Mirwais was the most dangerous for the Iranian authorities, about whom Giorgi wrote to the royal court that: " Mirwais is a dangerous person, against whom every measure should be taken to stop him there; That he is the instigator of past discords and irregularities and by his own character is destined to be a person who causes new disorder... such disorders as may prove dangerous to the state" (Hanway). "He (Mirwais) wants to mess up this country, don't let him go, otherwise he will do something to one of them" (Sekhnia). After Giorgi was killed, the Georgians who remained in Kandahar were also killed. "The tragic fate of their chiefs and officers was also shared by the rest of the Georgian detachments that were in Kandahar" (Hanway). „They killed remained Georgians. They occupied the castle of Kandahar, they made cattle upset. All the Georgians who were inside the castle were killed” (Sekhnia). During the decisive battle, "the Tatar army escaped from the king (Kaikhosro Batonishvili was assigned to fight against the Afghans after Giorgi) and some Georgians remained" (Sekhnia). “Mirweis attached by 16,000 cavalers to Persian army, who escaped during the first attack. General tried to return them back, but due to fear, all discipline was so drowned in them that all his attempts were in vain and he decided not survive because of such a disgrace.

At the head of a small detachment of Georgians, he went face to face with the Afghans and was killed with amazing bravery in the process of defending. (Hanway).- I will not be ashamed for my life and for my family. He got into like a hawk by a horse ... (Sekhnya)(**Khubua,1940:259-260**).

From the comparison of referred and other places, the rare identity of the reports of these two completely independent authors is clear. It is noteworthy, that they refer some details from the activities of Vakhtang similarly: He called a large army (60,000 people according to Hanway) to destroy the Lezghins , but due to the intervention of the Shah, the expedition failed and Vakhtang VI turned his back on goodwill of Iran forever (**Khubua,1940:261**). According to Sekhnia, Shah Hossein's sudden interruption of the campaign against the Lezghins caused great grief to the Vakhtang king: "On top of these news, the king received a summons from Khan and a robe, a return and a campaign from Shirvan Khan to Lezghins, resentment from the king and joy from the Lezghins" (**Sekhnia,1913:53-54**).

Despite this exact identity, there is also a difference between these authors. The story of George XI's death is described differently. We know that Sekhnia was not personally present at the tragedy in Kandahar. He was in Georgia that time and it means, that he described it based on others' narration. According to Sekhnia, Giorgi was killed by Mirweis supporters and in his presence during an obvious attack. As Hanway tells, a shrewd Afghan let his guard down and treacherously kills both him and his officers after a feast in their tents according to a pre-arranged plan (**Khubua, 1940:261**). It should be noted, that George XI, who arrived in Iran, did not stop contact with the Catholic missionaries. One of the patris, Pierre Ricard, treated King Giorgi and he was in a strong friendly relationship with him. There were always "two Capuchins, Brother Reginald da Conte and Brother Ambrogio da Milan with King Giorgi by the reason that they were required for the army: The king entrusted them with his family jewels, gold and precious stones. One of them, Reginaldo da Conte, died in Kirman... a golden cross was found on the chest of the king who was murdered in a brutal manner" - writes Jesuit Tadeusz Kruszynski (**Papashvili, 1995:238-239; Kruszynski , Th. 1740:276**).

The data given in the „Tskhovreba Mepeta“ by Sekhnia Chkheidze are identical not only to the sections taken for comparison from the works by Hanway, but also to the content of the respective chapters from „The History of Persia“ by M. Clairac which is based on the works of Ioseb Kartveli (**Gabashvili,1955:118**).

Based on above-mentioned, the most obvious conclusion is that the manuscript was compiled, as La Mamy Clairac says in his preface, by Ioseb Kartveli or the purpose to present it to the Grand Vizier of Turkey... John Hanway proves that he is obliged to Father Kruszyński, but Hanway is also closed to La Mamy Clairac by the word and phrase, as the latter is based on Ioseb, probably there was closer linkage between Kruszyński and Ioseb. (Tabaghua, 1979: 160).

Conclusion.

As it was shown, the individual historical stories are also described in the works of the European authors, in their memories and correspondents proving the reliability of the work by Sekhnia and it should not raise any doubt, as it is obvious that the Georgian historian living in Iran for a long time should have had the most abundant and reliable information about the current political events in Iran during this period and about Iran-Georgia relations. Based on the comparison of the above-mentioned historical sources, the reliability and historical value of the works by Sekhnia are proved. In its time, Valerian Gabashvili came to the conclusions based on the comparative study of the records by Sekhnia Chkheidze, Ioseb Kartveli and Polish traveler, chronicler and missionary, Tadeusz Krushinski, that „It is without doubt that the relationship with Georgians is main source for the famous works by Kruszyński, as it is well known the nature of the relationship between the Georgian princes in Iran and the Catholic missionaries“ (Gabashvili, 1955:120).

Comparison of Sekhnia Chkheidze and several reports of the European authors of XVII-XVIII cc makes clear the reliability of the author as a witness and increases the importance of the work as its primary historical source.

References

- Hanway (1729-1742) Hanway, J. 1729-1742. An historical account of British trade over the Caspian sea; vol I-II. London.
- Krusinski (1740) - Krusinski, Th. *Tragica Vertentis belli Persici Histpria per repetitas clades ab anno 1711 ad anno 1728 vum.* Leopoli, 1740, p. 276.
- Laurence (1958) Laurence Lockhart: *The fall of the Şafavī dynasty and the Afghan occupation of Persia*, XIII, 584 pp., 10 plates, map. Cambridge: University Press, p. 504-509

Weir (1922) - T.H. Weir, *The Revolution in Persia at the Beginning of the 18th Century* (from a Turkish MS in the University of Glasgow), *A Volume of Oriental Studies Presented to Professor Edward G. Browne*, Cambridge at the University Press, 480-490.

Gabashvili (1955) - Gabashvili, V., *Joseph Georgian-18th Century Diplomat and Historian*, "Materials for the History of Georgia and the Caucasus", Essay 32, Tbilisi;

Gobejishvili (1973) - Gobejishvili, M. , "The Lives of Kings" as a Source for the History of the Safavid State. *Georgian Source Studies IV*, Academy of Sciences of the Georgian SSR, Tbilisi;

Vakhushhti (1913) *Batonishvili Vakhushhti, The Life of Georgia 1469-1800*, Z. Chichinadze, Tbilisi;

Tamarashvili (1902) - Tamarashvili, M., *History of Catholicism among the Georgians with the Introduction and Explanation of Authentic Documents from the 13th to the 20th Century*. Tiflis;

Kakabadze (1926) - Kakabadze, S., *History of Giorgijanidze from Parsa*, Tiflis;

Lomsadze (1979) - Lomsadze, Sh., *From the History of Late Medieval Georgia*, Akhal-Tsikhuri Chronicles, Tbilisi;

Mamistvalishvili (2014) - Mamistvalishvili, E., *Who were the Catholics in 17th-18th Century Georgia?*, Kadmos N 6;

Mamistvalishvili (2019) - Mamistvalishvili, E., *Foreign Policy and Diplomacy of Georgia, (The Struggle for the Protection of Faith and National Independence. XVI-XVIII Centuries)*, Vol. III, Tbilisi;

Natroshvili (1991) - Natroshvili, T., *From the East to the West*. Publishing House "Nakaduli", Tbilisi;

Papashvili (1995) - Papashvili, M., *Georgian-Roman Relations VI-XX Centuries*. Publishing House "Aghmashenebeli", Tbilisi;

Papashvili, Mamistvalishvili, Gamezardashvili (2018) - Papashvili, M., Mamistva -Lishvili, E., Gamezardashvili, Z., *European sources about Georgia (last quarter of the 17th century), Italian and Latin texts, translation, introduction and notes*. Publishing House "Sachino", Tbilisi;

16. Tabagua (1979) - Tabagua, I., *On a manuscript preserved at the University of Glasgow*. Tbilisi. Language and Literature Series N3, Tbilisi;

Pavlenishvili, Ek. *Catholicism in Georgia (XIX century)*, Tbilisi, 2019

Pazhava (2022) - Pazhava, E., *The Genesis of Georgia's European Orientation*. The research was supported by the Shota Rustaveli National Science Foundation of Georgia [grant number YS-18-200]. Tbilisi;

Chkheidze (1913) - Chkheidze, S., *The Life of Kings*, in the book - *The Life of Georgia*, New Edition from 1469 to 1800. Described in two books. Second edition by Z. by Chichinadze, Tbilisi;

Khubua (1940) - Khubua, M., *On Georgian-Iranian Relations*, Moambe V-VI, N. Mari Institute of Language, History and Material Culture, Tbilisi;

Javakhishvili (1979) - Javakhishvili Iv., *The purpose, sources and methods of history, past and present*. Book I. *Old Georgian historical writing (V-XVIII centuries)*, Tbilisi, 1979. Tbilisi University Publishing House (in Georgian).

6

In Memory of Yaroslav Holovko (1962–2023)



Author Note

Liudmyla Hulciaieva

PhD in Economics, PhD in Economics, Head of the Department of International Projects at Kyiv Business School, Associate Professor at the Academy of Labour, Social Relations and Tourism, Associate of the GMAF Program at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Colleague, Collaborator, and Grateful Mentee of Yaroslav Holovko.

In Memory of Yaroslav Holovko (1962–2023)

A Distinguished Scientist, Educator, and Innovator Yaroslav Holovko, President of Kyiv Business School, Candidate of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, and Honored Worker of Education of Ukraine, passed away in 2023. Yaroslav contributed as a co-author of the concept and served as a member of the Scientific Board of the international journal Consortio - Journal of Economics, Social Sciences, Law and Education, published by the Zofia Zamenhof Foundation in Poland. He was a visionary leader in Ukraine whose contributions left a lasting impact on education, science, and international collaboration.

A Life of Academic and Professional Excellence

Born on July 10, 1962, in Kyiv, Yaroslav Holovko graduated with honors from the Faculty of Radiophysics at Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv in 1984, specializing in "Radiophysics and Electronics." In 1989, he defended his dissertation and earned the degree of Candidate of Physical and Mathematical Sciences. Driven by a passion for continuous learning, he obtained a qualification in "International Capital Markets" from the Institute of Securities in the UK in 1999 and a Master of Business Administration (MBA) from the Institute of International Business Relations in Germany in 2002.

Yaroslav's professional journey began at Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, where he worked as a Research Associate from 1984 to 1992. He later served as Director of the Ometa Training Center from 1992 to 1995, showcasing his exceptional organizational abilities and innovative thinking. In 1995, he assumed the role of Rector at the Kyiv Institute of Investment Management, transforming the institution into a leading educational hub during his 15-year tenure. Simultaneously, in 1999, he became President of Kyiv Business School, where he championed progressive educational initiatives and international collaboration until his passing in 2023. From 2010 to 2021, he also served as Vice-Rector for Strategic Development at the Academy of Labor, Social Relations, and Tourism, enhancing the institution's academic excellence and external partnerships.

From 2010 to 2021, Yaroslav Holovko served as Vice-Rector for Strategic Development at the Academy of Labor, Social Relations, and Tourism, where he strategically developed the institution's international cooperation, fostering enduring global partnerships and positioning the Academy as a key player in international education networks.

Yaroslav's career stands as a testament to visionary leadership and transformative impact, reshaping the landscape of education and innovation in Ukraine while inspiring generations of academics and professionals to pursue excellence on a global stage.

Leadership and Innovation

Yaroslav Holovko was a pioneer in promoting corporate social responsibility (CSR) in Ukraine, teaching its principles to students and business leaders, thus bridging academia and industry in fostering sustainable practices. As President of Kyiv Business School, he spearheaded the creation of innovative educational programs and, through his work in various organizations in Ukraine, established powerful project offices that advanced grant activities and fostered international collaboration. He was Council member of the Ukrainian Association of Management Development and Business Education. His leadership was instrumental in aligning Ukraine with global standards by facilitating access to prestigious professional qualifications such as CFA®, ACIIA®, and CIPA. Yaroslav co-founded the Ukrainian Society of Financial Analysts, representing Ukraine in the Association of International Investment Analysts (ACIIA), and contributed to international projects supported by USAID, BESO, the British Council, and Erasmus+.

Public and Civic Engagement

Yaroslav Holovko demonstrated a profound commitment to civic engagement through his active participation in the Public Council at the State Agency for Investment and Innovation, the Advisory and Expert Council of the State Commission on Securities and Stock Market, and the working group of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine on the "Prosperity through Agricultural Development" program.

In recognition of his outstanding contributions to education and leadership, he was awarded the title "Honored Worker of Education of Ukraine" in 2007.

Inspiring Mentor and Devoted Family Man

Yaroslav Holovko was not only a remarkable professional but also a dedicated mentor and trusted colleague, inspiring countless students and peers with his wisdom and vision. His ability to unite people around shared goals and foster meaningful connections was unparalleled. At home, he was a loving husband and father of two daughters, who continue to cherish his legacy.

His legacy of dedication, innovation, and kindness will forever remain in the hearts of those who knew him.



CONSORTIO
Scientific Journal



**In memory of
Gilberto Marzano
(1948 - 2023)**



CONSORTIO

Author Note

Scientific Journal

Simone Zorzi

**Director of disability services - Health authority
University of Udine (Italy)
Vice president of Ecoististuo Friuli Venezia Giulia
(Italy)
Visitor researcher at Rezekne Academy of
Technologies (Latvia)**

In memory of Gilberto Marzano

The launch of this scientific journal offers an opportunity to pay tribute to the memory of Gilberto Marzano, a computer scientist, academic, researcher, and prominent figure on the international stage. Born in Rome in 1948, Marzano graduated in Philosophy in 1971 from the Sapienza University of Rome, demonstrating from the outset his strong interest in research and in applying computer science to the humanities. Marzano spent many years of his career in Friuli Venezia Giulia, where he held prominent roles as a university professor, director of a research and development laboratory at a prestigious national software company, and president of the cultural association Ecoistituto of Friuli Venezia Giulia. With his tireless commitment, he contributed to promoting environmental sustainability and technological innovation in the region.

His academic career led him to teach at the Universities of Udine and Trieste, before taking on prestigious international positions, such as professor and head of the Pedagogical Technologies Laboratory at the Rezekne Academy of Technologies in Latvia and collaborator at the Janusz Korczak Pedagogical University in Warsaw, Poland. A pioneer in exploring the interactions between technology, education, and society, Marzano published numerous scientific works addressing topics such as social robotics, digital pedagogy, and creativity as a tool for tackling contemporary challenges.

His last work, *Sustaining Creativity and the Arts in the Digital Age*, represents his intellectual testament. This book explores the crucial role of creativity and the arts in the context of digital transformations, highlighting how they can serve as tools for innovation and progress in social, professional, and scientific contexts. With a forward-looking and multidisciplinary vision, Marzano synthesized years of studies and reflections, offering a unique perspective on how to preserve and enhance humanity and inventiveness in the digital age.

Gilberto Marzano left an indelible mark as a prolific author of scientific publications, a teacher, and a promoter of ethical and innovative values. His passing, on February 4, 2023, is a great loss for the scientific community, but his example remains alive in the values and objectives of this editorial initiative. We dedicate this first edition to him, confident that his work will continue to serve as a guide for scientific and human progress.

From the Editorial Team



“CONSORTIO Journal of Economics, Social Sciences, Law and Education” is a semi-annual journal created on the initiative and under the management of the Zofia Zamenhof Foundation. We publish works in the field of social sciences, economics, law and humanities. Our goal is to create a space for the international community of researchers and scientists to share their observations and research results.

Articles submitted for publication in “CONSORTIO Journal of Economics, Social Sciences, Law and Education” should be prepared according to the rules published on the website of the Salvation: www.fzzpublishing.eu